

SIGN OFF PAGE – from Study

Aeronautical Study – Review of Air Traffic and Aviation Weather Services Toronto-Buttonville, ON (CYKZ)

SIGNATURE PAGE

Originated by: Christine Gervais, Manager, Level of Service & Aeronautical Studies

Reviewed by: Marcel Pinon, Manager, Level of Service & Aeronautical Studies

Reviewed by: Boyd Barnes, National Manager, Level of Service

Reviewed by: Jeff Cochrane, Director, Navigation and Airspace

Reviewed By: Michelle Bishop – Director, Government and Public Affairs

Reviewed By: John Urban – General Manager, YYZ Flight Information Region

Reviewed By:	Title:	Signature:	Date:
Trevor Johnson	Assistant Vice-President, Service Delivery		

Approved By:	Title:	Signature:	Date:
Rudy Kellar	Executive Vice President, Service Delivery		

Please note the typo at the top as marked (for all 19 pages save the first) and the fact that even with all the errors noted this document was signed off by at least 6 senior managers with obviously little oversight or due diligence.

APPENDIX B

AIRCRAFT MOVEMENT STATISTICS

Movement	TORONTO/BUTTONVILLE (TWR)							
	2016				2017			
	Locals	VFR	IFR	Total Monthly	Locals	VFR	IFR	Total Monthly
Jan	2,212	1,360	306	3,878	454	482	249	1,185
Feb	1,556	1,282	278	3,116	398	587	219	1,204
Mar	2,270	2,152	359	4,781	382	681	308	1,371
Apr	3,044	2,873	422	6,339	480	969	454	1,903
May	4,078	3,249	520	7,847	484	1,043	1,332	2,859
Jun	4,070	3,774	472	8,316	598	1,332	428	2,358
Jul	2,854	3,181	461	6,496	996	1,711	433	3,140
Aug	3,610	3,424	577	7,611	686	1,821	416	2,923
Sep	3,142	3,202	603	6,947	0	0	0	0
Oct	3,068	2,478	559	6,105	0	0	0	0
Nov	2,766	2,021	334	5,121	0	0	0	0
Dec	396	493	243	1,132	0	0	0	0
Local Month	33,066	29,489	5,134	67,689	4,478	8,626	3,839	16,943

The May 2017 IFR number jumps out as incorrect. It is so out of line with other IFR #s as to lead one to question the competence of those who approved this chart. IFR numbers are always smaller than VFR at Buttonville especially at a training airport. This showed them almost three and half times the other months.

The 0's in the September to December field for 2017 was misleading as they were known by the time the report was released and should have been included. Then the totals at the bottom were not labeled as such but were for the 2016 year and so using the "nudge principle" (showing numbers lower than actual for 2017) the authors biased the reader to think the numbers in 2017 were much worse than they actually were.

This leads me to question the veracity of all the numbers in the study and the methodology of the study.

APPENDIX C

Aeronautical Study – Review of Air Traffic and Aviation Weather **Sercices** Toronto-Buttonville, ON (CYKZ)

Executive Summary

.....”

While the airport had been scheduled to close for redevelopment of the land for other uses, in April 2017, the Toronto-Buttonville airport operator announced it would continue airport operations until October 31, 2018 and possibly beyond that date should airport redevelopment dictate. ”

This paragraph is incorrect as Buttonville had told Nav Can they were not going to close on October 31, 2018 and in fact were growing the volumes with a flight school and attracting new clients. This had been told to Nav Can before the report was written. Additionally before the report was released the numbers were doubling and more. Even with this evidence Nav Can decided to close the tower in the busy summer months. It took a court challenge to stop that closure but then it appears Nav Can developed a strategy to “strangle” the airport and pretend it was re thinking the plan.”

Nevertheless, activity at the airport has been declining. Toronto Airways, the primary flight training school at Buttonville up until December 2016, merged with the Canadian Flight Academy (based at the Oshawa airport) to become one of Canada's largest flight training schools. Toronto Airways moved its flight school operation to the Oshawa airport in December 2016. Following the move, aircraft movements at the Toronto-Buttonville airport have fallen. The total movements for 2016 were 34,623, both IFR and VFR. The projected traffic levels for 2017 by solely removing the Toronto Airways movements would be 20,428.

The Aeronautical Study supports the proposal to close the Toronto-Buttonville air traffic control tower and the CWO. ”

The highlighted area is grossly misleading and intended to set Buttonville up for failure. The actual number for the year was 26,108 and increasing by over 100% a month when this report was released by Nav Can. (but not corrected). Even worse is the fact that the annual traffic number was known to be an understatement when the report was written in October. In October the traffic number was 22,731 movements, well in excessive of the number shown above and that was two months from the year end. Also at that time Nav Can had been told that there was a replacement flight school at Buttonville. To justify closure and publish projections that are incorrect is unacceptable and well below the standard one expects from our regulators.

APPENDIX D

Buttonville Movements as reported to Stats Canada

	2018						2017					
	January	February	March	April	May	June	July*	August*	September**	October	November	December
								understated due to reduced hours				
Buttonville												
Total, itinerant and local movements	2,247	2,479	3,788	3,729	5,349	5,011	5,122	4,473	4,290			
Itinerant movements	1,101	1,309	1,970	1,951	3,015	2,817	2,946	2,707	2,536			
Local movements	1,146	1,170	1,818	1,778	2,334	2,194	2,176	1,766	1,754			
TOTAL FOR YEAR TO DATE	1,146	1,170	1,818	1,778	2,334	2,194	2,176	1,766	1,754			
	2,247	4,494	6,973	10,761	14,490	19,839	24,850	29,972	34,445			
2018 PERCENTAGE INCREASE OVER 2017 YEAR TO DATE	89%	89%	95%	117%	111%	125%	122%	109%	100%			
* Tower hours reduced 25% from previous year												
** Tower hours reduced 50% from previous year												
Buttonville												
Total, itinerant and local movements	1,187	1,208	1,375	1,904	1,974	2,359	3,139	2,976	3,438	3,221	2,074	1,303
Itinerant movements	733	810	993	1,424	1,490	1,761	2,143	2,240	2,684	2,133	1,420	937
Local movements	454	398	382	480	484	598	996	686	754	1,088	654	366
Civil local movements	454	398	382	480	484	598	996	686	754	1,088	654	366
TOTAL FOR YEAR TO DATE	1,187	2,374	3,582	4,957	6,861	8,835	11,194	14,333	17,259	20,697	23,918	25,992